

10/2016

STATSREVISORERNE  
RIGSREVISIONEN



Extract from Rigsrevisionen's report on  
**the Ministry of Employment's  
data on resource programmes  
(employment initiative)**

submitted to the Public Accounts Committee



1849  
147.281  
237  
1976  
114.6  
22.480  
908

January 2017

# 1. Introduction and conclusion

## 1.1. PURPOSE AND CONCLUSION

1. This report concerns the effort made by the Danish Ministry of Employment to procure data for ongoing monitoring and evaluation of “resource programmes” (ressourceforløb). These programmes were introduced in January 2013 along with the reform of the early retirement and flexjob schemes. They are designed to develop the working capacity of socially vulnerable citizens with complex problems. By 2032, when the reform has been fully implemented, it is expected that 2 per cent of the citizens that have been through a resource programme are helped into ordinary employment or embarking on an education. The resource programmes represent a new cross-sectoral and holistic approach to job activation that combine services provided within the employment, social and health-care sectors. The reform is the first of several reforms that adopts a cross-disciplinary approach to employment initiatives.

2. The resource programmes affect many citizens; more than 18,000 citizens were taking part in the programmes in November 2016, and the Ministry of Employment expects this number to increase – along with the expenditure – in the years to come. Total benefit payments for citizens taking part in the programmes are estimated to be DKK 2.9 billion in 2016.

The Ministry of Employment’s responsibility for the resource programmes includes ongoing monitoring of the programmes. The municipalities are responsible for the implementation of the programmes, which may include components that involve different branches of municipal administration and various providers of regional health-care services. For regular monitoring and evaluation of the resource programmes, the Ministry of Employment must have access to usable data. As part of the reform of the early retirement and flexjob schemes, the Danish parliament therefore entrusted the ministry with the task of procuring the data necessary to do so.

3. The purpose of the study is to assess if the Ministry of Employment has procured the data required to monitor and assess the resource programmes. The data can provide the ministry with knowledge of lessons learnt and the extent to which the intention of the programmes is followed. With access to this information, the ministry will be well equipped to support the municipalities in the efforts targeted at a vulnerable group of citizens that have not been helped into employment through the usual employment initiatives.

The study covers the period June 2012 to November 2016. It was initiated by Rigsrevisionen in June 2016.

### **EARLY RETIREMENT PENSION**

This is a permanent pension that can be awarded to citizens who have no prospects of becoming employed or entering an education programme. Typically, the working capacity of these citizens is considerably and permanently reduced.

### **FLEXJOB**

A job adjusted to fit the working capacity of the employee. The employer pays for the effective hours worked and the employee receives a supplementary subsidy from the municipality. The size of the subsidy depends on the income earned.

### **JOBINDSATS.DK**

This is the Ministry of Employment's public online statistics portal. It provides data for measuring the results and effect of employment initiatives. The portal also facilitates evaluation of whether the employment initiatives fulfil the requirements of the legislation. Jobindsats.dk is mainly based on data reported from the municipalities' case-processing systems to the Ministry of Employment.

## **CONCLUSION**

Resource programmes were introduced with the reform of the early-retirement and flex-job schemes in January 2013 with the purpose of combining services provided within the employment, social and health-care sectors in order to help vulnerable citizens find employment or relevant training opportunities. Both the comments to the act on the reform and the responsibilities of the Ministry of Employment require the ministry to procure data for ongoing monitoring and evaluation of the cross-sectoral programmes. The ministry has so far procured social and health-care data only with the purpose of displaying more data on the government's general employment initiatives on its online statistics portal *jobindsats.dk*. It is the Ministry of Employment's strategy to use existing data for this exercise, to the extent practicable. The ministry has therefore had to obtain registry data from the social and health-care sectors. Rigsrevisionen recognises that this is an extensive as well as technically and legally complicated exercise. Taking into consideration, however, that the resource programmes were introduced four years ago, Rigsrevisionen does not find it satisfactory that the Ministry of Employment still has not procured the necessary data from the relevant registers. Nor has the ministry, in the absence of these data, followed up on the cross-sectoral combination of services through other means like, for instance, sampling.

The Ministry of Employment has ensured the availability of data for ongoing monitoring of the employment services since the implementation of the reform. However, data on social services provided to vulnerable citizens were not available during the first three years after the implementation of the reform and the data now available present a considerable challenge in terms of quality and completeness. The current available data on health services cannot be linked to the resource programmes and therefore cannot be used to follow up on the initiatives either. This means that the Ministry of Employment lacks registry data that can provide overview of the municipalities' implementation of a coordinated cross-sectoral and holistic approach, as intended by the act.

The Ministry of Employment's activities to procure data from the social and health-care sectors have depended on the legal authority of their partners in other areas of government to deliver the necessary data. According to the comments to the act, the ministry was required to launch a cross-sectoral data collaboration in order to 1. identify a data model for monitoring and assessing the resource programmes, and 2. initiate the process of receiving data from other areas of government. Rigsrevisionen has noted that the ministry has not taken steps to establish a data collaboration with relevant partners and thereby failed to seize the opportunity to create a forum for clarifying the substance of the authority to exchange data or discussing the data model across the ministries. It is Rigsrevisionen's assessment that a binding collaboration would have created a better foundation for developing a model and strategy for procuring registry data or other data suitable for monitoring and evaluating the new, cross-sectoral programmes.

The Ministry of Employment has taken steps to obtain knowledge of and support various aspects of the cross-sectoral programmes. However, the ministry has only carried out a single study of the municipalities' practical implementation of the resource programmes that combine services provided within employment, social services and health care. More than one third of the resource programmes included in the sample in the ministry's study from 2015 were not cross-sectoral, which indicates a gap in the ongoing monitoring of the programmes. The political parties behind the reform agreed that the ministry should carry out an evaluation of the initiatives by 2017, at the latest. It is Rigsrevisionen's assessment that the data currently available leave the ministry with limited opportunities to evaluate the use and the combination of services included in the programmes and their effect.