



Extract from the report to the  
Public Accounts Committee on  
the integration effort

February  
2015

revision  
revision

revision

---

# 1. Introduction and conclusion

## 1.1. Purpose and conclusion

1. This report concerns the effort made at Danish government and municipal level to integrate newly arrived refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member. Rigsrevisionen initiated the study in February 2014.

2. The framework of the Danish integration policy is defined in Consolidation Act. no. 1094 of 7 October 2014 on Integration of Aliens in Denmark (the Integration Act), which provides the starting point of this study.

The objectives of the Integration Act are to assist in ensuring that newly arrived foreigners are given the opportunity to use their abilities and resources to become self-supporting and participate in the life of society on an equal footing with other citizens and in compliance with fundamental values and norms of the Danish society.

3. The responsibility for the integration of foreigners is shared among several ministries. The study includes the following departments: the Ministry of Justice, the Ministry of Children, Gender Equality, Integration and Social Affairs (the Ministry of Social Affairs), the Ministry of Employment and the Ministry of Education. In the years 2001-2011, the responsibility for integration was placed in the then Ministry of Refugees, Immigrants and Integration (the then Ministry of Integration).

4. The responsibility for implementing the integration instruments in the Integration Act rests with the municipalities, which means that they are required to initiate the programmes prescribed by the Act within the time limits adopted by the Danish parliament. The municipalities' expenditure for the statutory integration effort, which amounted to approximately DKK 1,15 billion in 2013, is reimbursed by the Danish government.

5. The purpose of the study is to assess whether the Ministry of Justice, the Ministry of Employment, the Ministry of Social Affairs, the Ministry of Education and the municipalities adequately ensure that newly arrived refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member are offered participation in the statutory integration programmes. The report answers the following questions:

- Is the registration of newly arrived foreigners, who are entitled to enrol in an integration programme, reliable?
- Are the municipalities implementing the integration effort prescribed by the Integration Act?
- Do the Ministries of Social Affairs, Employment and Education adequately follow up on the implementation of the Integration Act?

All countries that are not members of the European Community are by the Member States referred to as **third countries**.

## CONCLUSION

It is Rigsrevisionen's overall assessment that the municipalities do not adequately ensure that newly arrived refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member are offered participation in the integration programmes referred to in the Integration Act. Nor have the responsible ministries followed sufficiently up on the effectiveness of the integration initiatives in achieving the objectives of the Integration Act.

When Rigsrevisionen received data for this study from the Integration Service in June 2014, the agency was unable to account for the legal basis upon which residence had been granted to approximately 1.200 foreigners from third countries, who had been assigned CPR numbers (personal identification numbers) by the municipalities. Subsequently, the Immigration Service has managed to reduce this number to 829 through mechanical and manual correction of errors performed in the period June 2014 to early in 2015. The Immigration Service has informed Rigsrevisionen that it is aware of the problems connected with matching its own data on the legal basis for residence with the CPR numbers. The Immigration Service has also drawn attention to the fact that it has improved the quality of data in a cooperation with other authorities in the area and the quality of the data has never been better, in the opinion of the Immigration Service.

In the opinion of Rigsrevisionen, it is unacceptable that there is still a discrepancy between the data on legal basis for residence held by the Immigration Service and the data held by the *Centrale Person Register* (office that is responsible for the administration of the CPR numbers). The cause of this discrepancy, which throws doubt on the right of residence of the affected foreigners with a CPR number, is unknown.

Rigsrevisionen considers it necessary to ensure that correct and reliable data are available in the future, so that the reasons for granting residence to foreigners with CPR numbers can be accounted for. The Immigration Service has informed Rigsrevisionen that it is not the agency's responsibility to solve this problem. It is not clear to Rigsrevisionen who the responsible authority is. The ministries that are responsible for the integration effort should therefore in collaboration with the municipalities, which are responsible for assigning the CPR numbers, find the cause of the problem and work out a satisfactory solution.

It is the municipalities' responsibility to ensure that all newly arrived refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member are offered participation in an integration programme, in accordance with the Integration Act. Rigsrevisionen has made a random sample of 109 newly arrived refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member, residing in 56 municipalities in order to establish whether they had been offered participation in the activities and programmes referred to in the Integration Act. The examination showed that the municipalities fail to implement the statutory integration instruments as intended in several areas. For instance, since 2006, the municipalities have been required to set up individual integration contracts with refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member. According to the Integration Act, the objective of setting up these individual contracts is to maintain and emphasize that both the local councils and the individual newly arrived refugees or immigrants that have been reunified with a family member have responsibilities and obligations in relation to the integration effort. 25 per cent of the contracts reviewed had not been entered within the required deadline and in 65 per cent of the contracts, no objectives had been defined for neither employment nor education, as otherwise prescribed by the Integration Act. The fact that the municipalities do not consistently implement the measures referred to in the Integration Act is considered unsatisfactory by Rigsrevisionen.

For various reasons, including inadequate data on refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member, the Ministry of Social Affairs and the Ministry of Employment have not ensured systematic follow-up on the municipalities' implementation of the Integration Act. The data issue is a reflection of a long-standing problem of matching CPR numbers with the data on basis for residence registered by the Immigration Service. The Ministry of Social Affairs and the Ministry of Employment have informed Rigsrevisionen that new data provided by Statistics Denmark, among others, will now make it possible to determine whether refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member are self-supporting. The Ministry of Social Affairs has pointed out that various supplementary data have provided the basis for carrying out analyses in the integration area, and the ministry has carried out a number of questionnaire surveys on the municipalities' implementation of the integration instruments. The Ministry of Employment has also called attention to the fact that it has been possible to follow up on newly arrived refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member that have received cash benefits. It has however, not been possible to follow up on the entire group, since the ministry has not had access to data on the total number of refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member.

The Public Accounts Committee was, already in 2003, critical of the extent to which the then Ministry of Integration had examined whether the objectives of the Integration Act were achieved. The Integration Act has been in force since 1999, and Rigsrevisionen has established that, in the intervening years, the ministries have not regularly followed up on the municipalities' implementation of the statutory integration instruments and their effectiveness in terms of achieving the objectives of the act. This is not considered satisfactory by Rigsrevisionen.

Since 2007, the Ministry of Education has been aware that the municipalities had difficulties with the educational supervision of the quality of the courses in Danish offered to refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member. With effect from 2010, the municipalities were instructed by the ministry to report on the outcome of their supervision. The ministry was not satisfied with the results reported by the municipalities in 2011, but did not take steps to improve the municipalities' supervision of the courses until 2014. The municipalities' supervision of the quality of the courses in Danish is still not satisfactory and Rigsrevisionen therefore concludes that the ministry's supervision and initiatives in the area have been inadequate.

Rigsrevisionen finds that the municipalities should strengthen their efforts to integrate newly arrived refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member in Denmark. Rigsrevisionen also finds that the ministries should follow up more diligently on the implementation of the Integration Act. For example, the Ministry of Social Affairs should, as the coordinating ministry with the overall responsibility for monitoring the development in the integration policy area, follow up more systematically on the implementation of the instruments in the Integration Act that are directed at refugees and immigrants reunited with a family member.